



Finance & Audit Committee Report - Appointment of Auditor

Whereas., a Request for Proposal (RFP) was initiated under the direction of the Membership for the 2025 Audit, the Finance and Audit Committee, having concluded the process (see below for a summary and the attached chronology of steps), is recommending the appointment of Vloet & Kan LLP as ACO's external auditor for fiscal year 2025.

Be it resolved, that Vloet & Kan be appointed as ACO's external auditor for the 2025 fiscal year.

Moved by: Taimoor Ali Kureshi (Treasurer); Seconded by:

Background:

During the June 2024 Annual General Meeting, a motion was passed to engage in a Request for Proposal (RFP) process to identify an audit firm for the 2025 financial year and present the recommendations at the 2025 Annual General Meeting.

The Finance and Audit Committee (FAC), led by Leslie Thompson (FAC member) began the process of conducting the RFP in September 2024. A summary of the steps is attached. The working group members included: Leslie Thompson (MFA, MBA, ICD.D, CMC, HRCC, ACO-TO Treasurer, past chair ACO); Marie May (May & Co., ACO's external bookkeeper); Will Coukell, ACO COO; Deb Crawford (ACO Chair)

Based on industry knowledge and recommendations from members of the FAC, the following seven (7) firms were invited to participate in the RFP process:

Adams & Miles LLP
Baker, Tilly KDN LLP
Davis Martindale LLP
Fruitman Kates LLP
Hogg Shaun & Scheck
Rashidi LLP
Vloet & Kan LLP
Welsh LLP

Three (3) confirmed interest and subsequently submitted proposals before 28 February 2025. These proposals were reviewed, clarification sought and finally assessed based

on a grid to determine the most suitable based on seven (7) factors. All three firms met the basic requirements, being certified as financial auditors with experience auditing NFP and charitable organizations. A rating grid was used to assess the submissions.

Findings:

The cost proposed by Welch LLP would be more than \$60,000 plus ACO would be required to purchase QuickBooks Online licenses (estimated at up to \$20,000/yr) for each of our branch operations plus the cost of transitioning to that platform. Rashidi LLP proposed a key planning meeting followed by the development of an audit plan “which may include significant variances to budgets....” The proposal did not demonstrate a commitment to complete the audit within the proposed budget or \$35,000 or a clear understanding of the complexity of auditing a Federated model such as ACO within the cost quoted. Overall Vloet & Kan LLP’s submission scored significantly higher than the other two (2) submissions. Below is a summary of the working group’s assessment of the proposals:

	Rashidi LLP	V & K LLP	Welch LLP
Expertise & Experience	7.25	8	8.25
Audit Team Quality	8.5	8.5	8.5
Audit Approach	4.25	9.25	4.25
Customer Support	4.5	8	4.25
Value for \$	4.25	8.25	3.75
QuickBooks	4.75	7.5	4.25
Other	6.5	8.25	6.5
Total	40	57.75	39.75